1	The effect of organic carbon on fixed nitrogen loss in the eastern tropical South Pacific and
2	Arabian Sea oxygen deficient zones
3	Bonnie X. Chang, ^{1,2,a,*} Jeremy R. Rich, ³ Amal Jayakumar, ² Hema Naik, ⁴ Anil Pratihary, ⁴
4	Richard G. Keil, ¹ Bess B. Ward, ² Allan H. Devol ¹
5	¹ School of Oceanography, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington
6	² Department of Geosciences, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey
7	³ Department of Ecology & Environmental Biology, Center for Environmental Studies, Brown
8	University, Providence, Rhode Island
9	⁴ National Institute of Oceanography, Dona Paula, Goa, India
10	*Corresponding author: <u>bxc@uw.edu</u>
11	^a Present address: Joint Institute for the Study of the Atmosphere and Ocean, Seattle, Washington
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	Running head: Nitrogen loss in oxygen deficient zones
24	

25 Acknowledgements

We thank the captains and crews of the R/Vs *Knorr* and *Roger Revelle* for their assistance collecting the samples for this study. We are grateful to S. W. A. Naqvi for the opportunity to study the Arabian Sea and to G. Holtgrieve for guiding the statistical analyses. We also acknowledge our colleagues at the University of Washington Stable Isotope Laboratory for analytical support. Thoughtful comments from two anonymous reviewers helped improve this manuscript. Support for this work was provided by National Science Fund grants to AHD and BBW and the Harry Hess Fellowship of Princeton University to BXC.

33 Abstract

34 The three major oxygen deficient zones (ODZs) of the world oceans (Eastern tropical North 35 and South Pacific (ETNP and ETSP, respectively), and Arabian Sea (AS) host the vast majority 36 of pelagic fixed nitrogen (N) loss and up to half of total marine N loss. An important control on 37 the absolute and relative importance of the two main pathways of N removal (denitrification and 38 anammox) is thought to be the input of organic matter. In this study, we investigated the 39 response of N loss in the ETSP and AS ODZs to addition of organic matter in the form of 40 glucose and naturally-derived dissolved and particulate organic matter (DOM and POM, 41 respectively). Fresh POM was collected using sediment traps deployed above the ODZ and trap 42 leachate was used as the DOM treatment. In the ETSP ODZ, the addition of glucose stimulated 43 denitrification (1.6 fold increase after 5 d) but not anammox (14 fold decrease after 5 d). In the 44 AS ODZ, only POM, not DOM, significantly increased rates of denitrification at the base of the 45 oxycline (5.4 - 6.4 fold increase after 2 d), but not at the secondary nitrite maximum. This may 46 be due to the more refractory nature of the DOM vs. POM (C:N ratio = 9.3 vs. 7.8, respectively) 47 and a higher carbon consumption rate at the shallower depth. These results suggest that 48 denitrification was generally limited by organic matter supply at the time of this study in both the ETSP and AS ODZs, although the lability of the organic matter is important. Interestingly, ${}^{15}N_2$ 49 50 produced in ETSP and AS incubations were not binomially distributed relative to the reactants 51 after the influence of anammox was taken into account, suggesting an alternative unknown 52 production mechanism or pathway of N removal.

53 Introduction

54 The vast majority of pelagic fixed nitrogen (N) removal occurs in three major oxygen 55 deficient zones (ODZs) of the world: the eastern tropical North and South Pacific (ETNP and 56 ETSP, respectively), and the Arabian Sea (AS). Although they comprise less than 1% of the 57 total volume of the ocean (Codispoti et al. 2001), the ODZs are responsible for at least a quarter 58 of total marine N loss (Codispoti et al. 2001). Wind-driven upwelling stimulates high productivity in the overlying waters of the ODZs, which sinks and fuels substantial respiration at 59 60 depth. Combined with poor ventilation of these regions, the result is a depletion of water column 61 oxygen to the extent that it becomes thermodynamically favorable for microbes to utilize NO_3 , 62 IO_3^- (Farrenkopf and Luther 2002), oxidized metals (Luther et al. 1997; Moffett et al. 2007), and SO_4^{2-} (Canfield et al. 2010) as electron acceptors during organic matter oxidation. Within the 63 open ocean ODZs, the majority of organic matter respired is ultimately coupled to the reduction 64 of NO_3^- . Although the SO_4^{2-} concentration is orders of magnitude higher than the NO_3^{--} 65 66 concentration, there is no accumulation of H₂S, implying reduced S is efficiently reoxidized, 67 likely via direct or indirect coupling to the reduction of NO_3^- (Canfield et al. 2010). Numerous transformations of fixed N can occur; however, once converted to N₂O or N₂, N becomes 68 69 biologically inaccessible except to N₂ fixing microbes.

The two major pathways of fixed N loss in the ODZs are denitrification and the anaerobic oxidation of ammonium (anammox). Denitrification is a heterotrophic process that proceeds via a stepwise process in which organic carbon oxidation is coupled to the sequential reduction of Noxides to gaseous end products: $NO_3^- \rightarrow NO_2^- \rightarrow NO \rightarrow N_2O(g) \rightarrow N_2(g)$. Anammox is an autotrophic process, gaining energy from the oxidation of NH_4^+ to N_2 using NO_2^- . Due to the importance of the 3 major ODZs to the balance of fixed N in the ocean, there has been

substantial interest in determining the contribution of these two processes to total pelagic N
removal, especially given the potential of these regions to change with changing climate.

 15 N-labeling experiments have suggested that anammox is responsible for the majority of N₂ 78 79 production in the ETSP (Thamdrup et al. 2006; Hamersley et al. 2007; Kalvelage et al. 2013) and 80 AS (Jensen et al. 2011) ODZs. In contrast, other studies in the ETSP (Dalsgaard et al. 2012) and 81 the AS ODZs (Nicholls et al. 2007; Ward et al. 2009) identified heterotrophic denitrification to 82 be the dominant N loss pathway. There is evidence that both denitrification and anammox are 83 regulated by the availability of organic matter in the ODZs (Ward et al. 2008; Kalvelage et al. 84 2013), and this discrepancy in the relative contributions of denitrification and anammox to N 85 removal in the ETSP and AS ODZs has been ascribed to the differing responses of anammox and 86 denitrifying bacteria to organic matter availability (Thamdrup et al. 2006; Ward et al. 2009; 87 Dalsgaard et al. 2012).

88 Seasonally changing wind patterns in all three ODZs give rise to temporally varying 89 productivity, which, in turn, affect the timing and quantity of organic matter reaching the ODZs 90 (Lee et al. 1998). If the flux of organic matter to the ODZs is linked to surface productivity, the 91 degree to which carbon is available to microbes in either the ETSP or AS ODZ would also be 92 both spatially and temporally heterogeneous. Denitrifiers have been found to be abundant and 93 diverse, capable of rapid growth in response to episodic inputs of organic matter (Ward et al. 94 2008). Anammox bacteria grow more slowly (Van de Graaf et al. 1995) and may maintain a 95 lower though more constant rate of N removal in the ODZs. Although anammox is itself an autotrophic process, the substrates anammox depends upon (i.e., NH_4^+ and NO_2^-) are produced 96 by the oxidation of organic matter. NH_4^+ is generated at each step of the successive reduction of 97 98 N-oxides during heterotrophic denitrification. Additionally, dissimilatory nitrate reduction to

ammonium (DNRA, Lam et al. 2009; Jensen et al. 2011) and sulfate reduction (Canfield et al. 2010), both heterotrophic processes, may supply anammox with NH_4^+ . NO_2^- is formed via the reduction of NO_3^- during the oxidation of organic matter. NO_2^- might also be produced by NH_4^+ oxidation (Kalvelage et al. 2013), however this pathway depends on the availability of NH_4^+ and thus, organic matter oxidation.

104 The objectives of this work were to investigate the effect of organic matter quality and 105 availability on the rates of N loss in the ETSP and AS ODZs. In the ETSP ODZ, we measured 106 the rates and relative contributions of denitrification and anammox in incubations with and 107 without the addition of a simple organic compound (glucose). In the AS ODZ, we used freshly 108 collected dissolved organic matter (DOM) and sinking particulate organic matter (POM) from 109 sediments traps deployed directly above the ODZ in order to assess the response of N₂ 110 production to naturally derived organic matter. We chose these forms of organic matter because 111 although bacteria most readily take up DOM, a significant source of DOM in the interior of the 112 ocean is the degradation of POM. In addition to acting as a source of DOM, bacteria directly 113 colonize POM and take advantage of living adjacent to both substrate and other bacteria 114 performing complementary redox transformations (Karl et al. 1984) 115

116 Methods

117 Study site and sample collection

118 Incubation experiments were carried out at one station in the ETSP ODZ aboard the R/V

119 Knorr (October – November 2005) and at two stations in the AS ODZ aboard the R/V Roger

120 *Revelle* (September – October 2007) (Table 1). Samples were collected using a rosette of 10 or

121 30 L Niskin bottles equipped with dissolved oxygen (O₂) sensors calibrated by Winkler

122 titrations, in addition to conductivity, temperature, and pressure sensors.

123 Sampling depths were chosen based on O_2 and nitrite (NO_2^{-}) concentrations: at the secondary NO₂⁻ maximum (SNM), and at the shallowest depth where O₂ was undetectable (base of the 124 125 oxycline; in AS only). The base of the oxycline was chosen based on previous studies, which 126 have reported the highest rates of N₂ production at the top of the ODZ, possibly due to the 127 relatively high flux of POM compared to deeper in the ODZ. The SNM was also sampled as it is 128 associated with the most oxygen depleted waters (Thamdrup et al. 2012) and has classically been 129 regarded as a zone of active N loss (Codispoti and Christensen 1985). 130 Incubations were carried out in duplicate in acid-washed, large-volume, gas-tight trilaminate 131 bags (Pollution Management Corporation) fitted with three-way stopcocks. Prior to sampling, 132 bags were flushed at least three times with CO_2 to eliminate O_2 from any possible headspace and 133 evacuated. Approximately 8 L of water were gravity-fed into each bag directly from a Niskin 134 bottle, taking care to prevent any contact with the atmosphere. The headspace of each Niskin 135 bottle was continuously flushed with CO_2 through the vent to prevent atmospheric O_2 contamination during sampling. Bags received additions of ¹⁵N-labeled NO₃⁻ (in ETSP only), 136 137 NO_2^- (in AS only) or NH_4^+ (in both, Table 2). 138 In the ETSP, dissolved organic matter (DOM) in the form of glucose was also added to $^{15}NO_3^{-1}$ and $^{15}NH_4^{+1}$ labeled incubations to a final concentration of 2 μ mol C L⁻¹. In the AS 139 experiments, ¹⁵NO₂ labeled incubations were amended with POM and DOM collected in situ 140 from the AS ODZ (see below for details of collection and preparation) with and without ¹⁴NH₄⁺. 141 142 Tracers and amendments were added while filling each bag either by injecting directly into the 143 Tygon tubing connecting the Niskin to the bag or through the three-way valve. POM was added

144 to the bags to a final concentration of 2.6 μ mol C L⁻¹ and 0.33 μ mol N L⁻¹ at Sta. 1 and 1.3 μ mol 145 C L⁻¹ and 0.17 μ mol N L⁻¹ at Sta. 2, determined by CHN elemental analyzer. At both Sta. 1 and 146 2, DOM was added to the bags to a final concentration of 0.24 μ mol C L⁻¹ and 0.026 μ mol N L⁻¹, 147 respectively, determined by total organic carbon and nitrogen analyzer (TOC-V/Total Nitrogen 148 M-1 Shimadzu).

149 For the AS experiments, POM was collected at a depth in the oxycline, approximately 20 and 50 m above the ODZ proper at Sta. 1 and 2, respectively, using a NetTrap (Petersen et al. 2005), 150 151 a large diameter (~2 m), free-floating sediment trap, based on the design of a closing plankton 152 net, capable of collecting large amounts of sinking POM (> 50 μ m) in relatively short time periods (24 - 36 h). Contents of the cod end were filtered through a glass fiber filter (0.7 μ m 153 154 nominal pore size). Filtrate (trap leachate) was collected for use as the DOM amendment. The 155 material on the filter was resuspended into a smaller quantity of site water for use as the POM 156 amendment. Each organic matter addition was degassed before introduction to the bag by 157 applying a vacuum to cause continuous boiling for ~15 min. Ambient and tracer concentrations of NO_3^- , NO_2^- , and NH_4^+ in all incubations were measured 158 159 by autoanalyzer using standard colorimetric techniques (Strickland and Parsons 1972). 160 Additionally, in the ETSP incubations, NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ were measured by autoanalyzer at approximately 12 h intervals for the length of the incubation. Detection limits of NO₃⁻, NO₂⁻, 161 and NH₄⁺ were 0.08, 0.01, and 0.07 μ mol L⁻¹, respectively. 162

163

164 ¹⁵N-labeled incubations

165 Samples for the determination of ${}^{29}N_2$ and ${}^{30}N_2$ were taken following the method of Emerson 166 et al. (1999). Approximately 150 mL of water was drawn from the Niskin bottles (representing

167 initial N₂ gas and isotope concentrations) or from a bag into 300 mL HgCl₂-poisoned, pre-168 evacuated glass flasks equipped with a 9 mm, gas-tight, single o-ring valves (Louwers-Hapert). 169 The flasks were returned to the University of Washington where they were weighed and 170 dissolved gases were equilibrated with the headspace of the flask at a constant temperature for 24 171 hours. The headspace gases were transferred to a stainless steel finger immersed in liquid He, 172 during which water and CO₂ were trapped cryogenically. Samples were analyzed on a Finnigan 173 Delta XL dual inlet isotope ratio mass spectrometer for mass ratios 29:28, 30:28, 28:40, relative 174 to an in-house gas standard with known gas and isotope ratios. Anammox and denitrification rates were calculated from the production of ¹⁵N-labeled N₂ following de Brabandere et al. 175 176 (2013). 177 178 Statistical analyses

The effects of treatments on the rates of N_2 production in the AS incubations were examined using an analysis of variance (ANOVA). The factors affecting N_2 production that were considered were location (Sta. 1 or 2), depth (base of oxycline or SNM), ¹⁴NH₄⁺ (with or without), and organic matter (control, POM, and DOM). A post hoc comparison using Tukey's HSD test was used to evaluate differences in organic matter treatments. All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS version 13.

185

186 *Results*

187 Hydrographic conditions

188 At the ETSP study site, the ODZ (defined as the minimum value reached by the Seabird
189 oxygen sensor mounted to the sampling rosette) extended from approximately 75 to 400 m. The

190	mixed layer was shallow (< 20 m, defined as a change in σ_{0} > 0.03 kg m ⁻³ [de Boyer Montégut et
191	al. 2004]), sea surface temperature (SST) was relatively low (15.3 $^{\circ}$ C), and [NO ₃ ⁻] and [PO ₄ ³⁻]
192	were relatively high in surface waters (5.9 and 0.8 μ mol L ⁻¹ , respectively), all of which are
193	indicative of active upwelling. [NO ₂ ⁻] was detectable at the surface (0.2 μ mol L ⁻¹) and formed a
194	broad secondary maximum within the ODZ (maximum 4.4 μ mol L ⁻¹). A distinct primary NO ₂ ⁻
195	maximum (PNM) was not detected, probably due to the sampling distribution being too coarse to
196	resolve the narrow peak. $[NH_4^+]$ was as high as 0.3 μ mol L ⁻¹ in the mixed layer, decreasing to
197	below detection (< 0.05 μ mol L ⁻¹) in and below the ODZ.
198	The AS field campaign took place at the end of the high productivity southwest monsoon,
199	although conditions were already transitioning to the more oligotrophic fall intermonsoon as
200	indicated by relatively high SST (28.8°C) and a shallow mixed layer (40 m) in which $[NO_3]$ and
201	$[PO_4^{3-}]$ were undetectable. Hydrographic conditions were previously reported by Ward et al.
202	(2009), which we will summarize here. A distinct PNM was present at the base of the mixed
203	layer (maximum 0.9 and 2.8 μ mol L ⁻¹ , at Sta. 1 and 2, respectively), underlain by a much larger
204	SNM (maximum 5.7 and 7.7 μ mol L ⁻¹ , at Sta. 1 and 2, respectively), which extended from
205	approximately 100-150 to 400 m. At the more northern station sampled (Sta. 1), O_2 was
206	undetectable from approximately 100 to 800 m. At the more southern station sampled (Sta. 2),
207	the ODZ was slightly thinner, extending from 150 to 800 m. $[NH_4^+]$ was as high as 0.6 μ mol L ⁻¹
208	in the mixed layer, decreasing to below detection (< 0.05 μ mol L ⁻¹) in and below the ODZ.
209	
210	N tuguatory ations and loss in ETSP OD7 in out ations

210 *N transformations and loss in ETSP ODZ incubations*

At Sta. 20 in the ETSP, in the incubations with glucose, the initial concentration of 24 μ mol L⁻¹ NO₃⁻ was rapidly drawn down to < 1 μ mol L⁻¹ in less than 3 days, and undetectable by 5.5

213	days (Fig. 1a). There was some NO_2^- accumulation until 1.5 days, after which NO_2^- was quickly					
214	consumed to undetectable levels by 4.5 days (Fig. 1b). This pattern of nutrient consumption was					
215	in contrast to the incubation in which no organic carbon was added. In these incubations, NO_3^-					
216	remained unchanged or even slightly increased until approximately 3 days, after which NO_3^-					
217	steadily decreased to undetectable levels by 11.5 days. Nitrite decreased ~1 μ mol L ⁻¹ for one day					
218	before slowly increasing to maximum values by $9.5 - 10$ days followed by rapid consumption to					
219	undetectable levels by 11.5 days.					
220	Samples for ${}^{15}N_2$ production were taken at 5.7 days (Fig. 2). In the control incubations (only					
221	¹⁵ N tracers added), the average denitrification rate over the length of the incubation was 2.6 nmol					
222	N_2 h ⁻¹ , and the average anammox rate was 0.9 nmol N_2 h ⁻¹ over the course of the incubation. In					
223	the incubations amended with glucose, the average denitrification rate was 4.2 nmol $N_2 \ h^{\text{-1}}$					
224	during the length of the incubation and the average anammox rate was 0.06 nmol $N_2 h^{-1}$ over the					
225	course of the incubation.					
226						
227	Sediment trap organic matter composition in the AS					

Arabian Sea DOM (trap leachates) had an atomic C:N ratio of 9.3. This ratio is higher than that of the particulate trap flux, which had an average C:N ratio of 7.8.

230

231 N loss in AS ODZ incubations

232 The addition of ${}^{14}NH_4^+$ had no significant effect on ${}^{29}N_2$ or ${}^{30}N_2$ production in the AS

- regardless of station, depth, or organic matter addition ($F_{1,21} = 0.486$, p > 0.05, data not shown).
- 234 Since the addition of ${}^{14}NH_4^+$ had no significant effect on ${}^{15}N_2$ production rates, all rates with and

without organic matter additions are presented as an average of the treatments with and without $^{14}NH_4^+$.

In the AS incubations, samples for ${}^{15}N_2$ production were taken at approximately 2 days. ${}^{15}N_2$ 237 production rates by anammox (in ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ amended incubations) and denitrification (in ${}^{15}NO_2^-$ 238 239 amended incubations with no organic matter additions) were previously published in Ward et al. 240 (2009). We present them here as the 'control' to assess the effect of organic matter additions on 241 N₂ production rates. At Sta. 1, in the control incubations (no organic matter additions), the 242 average denitrification rates over the length of the incubations were 0.21 ± 0.14 and 0.15 ± 0.06 nmol N_2 h⁻¹, at the base of the oxycline and SNM, respectively (Fig. 3a). At Sta. 2, in the control 243 244 incubations, the average denitrification rates over the course of the incubations were 0.06 ± 0.02 and 0.05 ± 0.02 nmol N₂ h⁻¹, at the base of the oxycline and SNM, respectively (Fig. 3b). 245 246 The two organic carbon treatments, DOM and POM collected freshly from sediment traps, had different effects on denitrification rates (determined from ³⁰N₂ production) in the AS ODZ 247 248 (Fig. 3a,b). Tukey's post hoc test revealed that denitrification rates with and without DOM were 249 not significantly different (p > 0.05). The addition of POM from sediment traps significantly 250 increased denitrification rates at both stations relative to the control (p < 0.05) at the base of the 251 oxycline only ($F_{1,10} = 10.255$, p < 0.01), however the response of denitrification to the addition of POM was not significantly different between the two stations ($F_{1,10} = 0.565, p > 0.05$). 252 253 Average denitrification rates in the POM treatment at the base of the oxycline was 6.4 times 254 larger than the control at Sta. 1 and 5.4 times larger at Sta. 2. Parallel incubations with ¹⁵NH₄⁺ only without any additions of organic matter were carried 255 256 out at each station and depth in the AS (Fig. 3a,b), which allowed the determination of the

257 control anammox rate. At Sta. 1, the average anammox rates during incubations were $0.005 \pm$

258 0.0004 and 0.007 \pm 0.0009 nmol N₂ h⁻¹, at the base of the oxycline and SNM, respectively. At 259 Sta. 2, the average anammox rates during incubations were 0.009 \pm 0.008 and 0.06 \pm 0.05 nmol 260 N₂ h⁻¹, at the base of the oxycline and SNM, respectively.

261

262 Discussion

263 Effect of dissolved organic carbon (glucose) on N loss in the ETSP

Concentrations of DOC in the Pacific Ocean range from as high as 70 μ mol L⁻¹ in the low 264 latitude surface ocean to $< 40 \ \mu \text{mol L}^{-1}$ in the deep ocean (Hansell and Carlson 1998). The 265 amount of glucose added to incubations in this study (2 μ mol C L⁻¹) was only a small fraction of 266 267 the DOC naturally present. However, this ambient DOC is thought to be very old (4000 - 6000)268 y B. P.), estimated from radiocarbon measurements (Druffel et al. 1992), indicating that the 269 majority of this DOC is refractory and is returned to the deep unrespired after a complete ocean 270 mixing cycle. Glucose $(C_6H_{12}O_6)$ is a simple carbohydrate that is a readily utilizable energy 271 source by microorganisms that yields ATP via glycolysis, thus, even a relatively small amount of 272 glucose may fuel relatively high rates of bacterial respiration.

273 At Sta. 20 in the ETSP, both the control and glucose-amended incubations exhibited NO_3^- 274 consumption, and NO_2^- accumulation and consumption in a classic denitrifying sequence, as 275 observed in bacterial cultures, which is controlled by the enzyme kinetics of each step of 276 denitrification (Betlach and Tiedje 1981). The addition of glucose to these incubations 277 stimulated NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ reduction by supplying substrate to a carbon-limited system (Fig. 1a,b). The average denitrification rate measured by the production of ${}^{15}N_2$ was 1.6 times higher 278 279 in the incubations with the addition of glucose compared to without (Fig. 2). Conversely, the 280 average anammox rate was an order of magnitude lower in the glucose treatments compared to

the control. Although glucose does not contain organic N, which would be remineralized to NH₄⁺ potentially for anammox, it is unlikely that anammox bacteria in these incubations were NH₄⁺-limited due to the addition of 1 μ mol L^{-1 15}NH₄⁺ tracer.

284 These results support the findings of Dalsgaard et al. (2012) in the ETSP ODZ, who

285 hypothesize a lack of close coupling between denitrification and anammox based on the

286 observation that denitrification rates were high when anammox rates were low and vice versa.

287 Dalsgaard et al. (2012) argue that the lack of close coupling may be due to the relative response

times of the different microorganisms involved: denitrifiers are fast-growing and can respond

289 quickly to episodic inputs of organic matter, whereas anammox bacteria are relatively slow-

290 growing which limits the rate of their response to increased substrate; however, they

subsequently maintain lower rates for longer periods of time.

292

293 *Effect of* NH_4^+ *on denitrification in the AS*

Previous researchers have also found no significant increase in the anammox rate (determined from $^{29}N_2$ production) in $^{15}NO_{2,3}$ labeled incubations with $^{14}NH_4^+$ compared to without (Kuypers et al. 2005; Thamdrup et al. 2006). This is somewhat unexpected since $[NH_4^+]$ in both the Benguela upwelling and ETSP ODZs is frequently below detection suggesting anammox could be limited by $[NH_4^+]$. Thamdrup et al. (2006) speculated that no stimulation of anammox by the addition of NH_4^+ may reflect extremely efficient ammonium uptake by anammox bacteria, which would lead to reaching saturating concentrations at a relatively low $[NH_4^+]$.

301

302 Effect of dissolved organic matter on denitrification in the AS

The absence of a significant response from the addition of DOM indicated that denitrifiers in the AS ODZ were either restricted in their ability to respire the DOM added due to its possibly refractory nature (Druffel et al. 1992), or did not receive sufficient additional DOM to cause a response. Due to the significant increase in denitrification rates by the addition of POM (*see* discussion in following section), it is unlikely that denitrifiers had no response to the addition of DOM because they were not carbon-limited.

309 The C:N ratio of the DOM was high (9.3) compared to both the Redfield ratio (6.6) and the 310 POM collected concurrently in the sediment trap (7.8), suggesting the DOM was more 311 chemically degraded. Labile N-rich proteins and amino acids are preferentially remineralized 312 leaving behind the more refractory fraction of DOM (Walker and McCarthy 2012). Another 313 possibility is that not enough DOM was added to cause a response. Approximately an order of 314 magnitude less organic C and N were added to DOM amended incubations compared to POM treatments. Although the aim was to add a comparable amount of organic matter to all POM and 315 316 DOM treatments, the exact composition and concentration of both the POM and DOM were 317 determined only upon return to a land-based laboratory and as such, was unknown at the time the 318 incubations were being carried out.

319

320 *Effect of particulate organic matter on denitrification in the AS*

321 Stimulation by the addition of only the particulate form of organic matter suggests that we 322 may have essentially inoculated the bag incubations with denitrifying microbes associated with 323 the POM, or provided ample labile organic carbon for respiration, or both. Previous work 324 analyzing the chemical composition of sinking POM captured in sediment traps has concluded 325 that sinking POM is composed of more labile organic matter relative to suspended POM or

326 DOM. A significant increase in denitrification rates was observed at the base of the oxycline 327 only, and not at the SNM, at both stations suggesting that it was the POM itself, not particle 328 associated denitrifiers that gave rise to increased denitrification rates. If the stimulation were due 329 to new bacteria introduced with the POM, a comparable absolute increase in rates at both depths 330 at each station would be expected. Additionally, although double the amount of POM was added 331 to incubations at Sta. 1 relative to Sta. 2, the proportional increase in the average denitrification rates relative to the control at the base of the oxycline of both stations was similar (6.4 vs. 5.4 332 333 fold increase at Sta. 1 and 2, respectively) suggesting the original bacterial population in each 334 incubation had comparable responses to the addition of POM. However, the absolute increase in denitrification rates at Sta. 1 was triple that of Sta. 2 (1.1 vs. 0.3 nmol L⁻¹ h⁻¹, respectively), 335 336 although double the POM was added at Sta. 1 relative to Sta. 2, further suggesting that the 337 increased denitrification rates were due to a stimulation of the original bacterial population in the bags, not due to bacteria introduced with the POM. 338

The flux of organic matter is correlated to the rate of fixed N removal in the ETSP and AS 339 340 ODZs (Jensen et al. 2011; Kalvelage et al. 2013) suggesting organic matter is an important 341 control on this process. Further supporting this conclusion is the observation that rates of N_2 342 production generally decrease with increasing depth in both these regions (Thamdrup et al. 2006; 343 Jensen et al. 2011; Dalsgaard et al. 2012), following the trend of decreasing organic matter flux 344 with increasing depth (Martin et al. 1987). Additionally, carbon limitation of denitrification in 345 the ETSP has been directly measured in incubations (Ward et al. 2008). In the present study, we 346 hypothesize that the significant stimulation of denitrification at the base of the oxycline only, not 347 the SNM, by the addition of POM is due to increased respiration leading to elevated organic 348 carbon demand at the shallower depth.

349 The magni

The magnitude of the POM additions (2.6 and 1.3 μ mol C L⁻¹ at both depths at Sta. 1 and 2,

- respectively) can be evaluated in the context of ambient POC fluxes and remineralization rates inthe AS. The Martin equation (Martin et al. 1987):
- 352 POC flux at depth z = POC flux at $100m \times (z/100)^{-b}$ (1) 353 was used to estimate the POC flux to the depths sampled in this study. Temporal patterns of 354 productivity and POC export in the AS are dominated by seasonal monsoonal cycles with the 355 highest productivity and export during the Northeast and Southwest monsoons (Lee et al. 1998). A ²³⁴Th-based average export from a comparable depth, location, and season as this study (100 356 m at an open ocean AS ODZ station during the SW monsoon) is 10.85 mmol C $m^{-2} d^{-1}$ (Lee et al. 357 358 1998). An estimate of the attenuation coefficient (b) in Eq. 1 at the same open ocean AS ODZ 359 station is 0.74 (Berelson 2001). In order to specify a depth interval over which POC is 360 consumed, the 8 L bag incubation is assumed to be a cube with a height of 0.2 m. Using these 361 values, the average in situ rates of POC consumption in these incubations would be 0.08, 0.04, and 0.02 μ mol C L⁻¹ d⁻¹ at 100, 150, and 200 m. These calculated POC consumption rates are 362 363 comparable to measured bacterial carbon demand associated with different forms of POC (Smith 364 et al. 1992). Although the POC additions in this study exceeded the estimated POC consumption 365 rate at all depths, it may be that the base of the oxycline harbors a more active and/or denser 366 bacterial population relative to the deeper SNM due to a chronically larger POC flux and thus, 367 were able to produce a larger response to the addition of fresh POC.
- 368

369 Amammox and the source of excess $^{29}N_2$ production in ETSP and AS incubations

370 During the 2005 R/V *Knorr* cruise to the ETSP, additional ${}^{15}NO_{3}^{-}$ amended bag incubations

371 were carried out at other stations using the same method described here (data not shown). After

372 2 days, ²⁹N₂ and ³⁰N₂ produced by denitrification were binomially distributed after taking the 373 production due to anammox into account, such that the total ²⁹N₂ produced was equal to the sum 374 of ²⁹N₂ from anammox (determined from a parallel incubation with ¹⁵NH₄⁺) and ²⁹N₂ from 375 denitrification (predicted from ³⁰N₂ assuming a binomial distribution of N₂ relative to the initial 376 fraction labeled of ¹⁵NO₃⁻).

377 However, this was not true after 5.7 days in the ETSP incubations (Fig. 2) and in all of the AS incubations after 2 days (Fig. 4a,b). In these incubations more $^{29}N_2$ was produced than could be 378 accounted for based on the fraction of the initial $NO_{2,3}$ that was labeled, after taking into account 379 the production due to anammox. We name this excess the residual $^{29}N_2$ (Δ_{resid}). It is defined as 380 the difference between the total measured ${}^{29}N_2$ production rate and the ${}^{29}N_2$ production rate 381 382 predicted from the sum of anammox and denitrification rates, assuming that the isotopic 383 composition of the products is binomially distributed relative to the reactants. Nicholls et al. (2007) in the AS found the isotopic composition of ${}^{15}N_2O$ produced by 384 385 denitrification was binomially distributed relative to the starting pool of NO₂⁻. However, similar to the results in this study, ¹⁵N₂ production could not be predicted by the binomial distribution. 386 387 Trimmer and Purdy (2012) measured N_2 production that was not via canonical denitrification or 388 anammox, and hypothesized amine groups on allylthiourea (ATU) were directly oxidized to N₂ by NO₂⁻. In incubations with ${}^{15}NO_2$ ⁻ in the ETSP, de Brabandere et al. (2013) observed ${}^{15}N_2$ 389 390 production that was non-binomially distributed after production by anammox had been taken into account. These researchers speculated that production of ${}^{29}N_2$ via denitrification in the ${}^{15}NO_2^{-1}$ 391 392 incubations might be underestimated if denitrifiers reduced ambient NO3⁻ directly to N2 393 intracellularly, without allowing the NO₂⁻ to mix completely with the ambient NO₂⁻ pool ('nitrite 394 shunting').

Production of $^{29}N_2$ in excess of the predicted binomial distribution indicates that the $^{15}N_2$ 395 396 labeled fraction of the reactant pool is not well known. To further explore possible mechanisms responsible for the production of Δ_{resid} , we calculated the average ¹⁵N-labeled fraction of the 397 reactant pool that would have been required to produce the observed $^{29}N_2$ and $^{30}N_2$, with no Δ_{resid} , 398 399 assuming the anammox rates measured in the control incubations remained constant across all 400 treatments (this is reasonable considering the slow growth rate of anammox bacteria relative denitrifiers) and ¹⁵N₂ was binomially distributed relative to the reactants. In the ETSP 401 incubations, the fraction of the NO₃⁻ pool that was ¹⁵N-labeled was approximately 0.1. In order 402 to produce the observed distributions of ${}^{29}N_2$ and ${}^{30}N_2$ at 5.7 d, the ${}^{15}N$ -labeled fraction of the 403 404 reactant pool must have been much lower: 0.002. In the AS incubations, the fraction of the NO_2^{-1} pool ¹⁵N-labeled was between 0.4 – 0.7. For $\Delta_{\text{resid}} = 0$, the fraction of the reactant pool ¹⁵N-405 406 labeled must have been 0.001 - 0.5. These results indicate that direct oxidation of organic N to N_2 is probably not the only mechanism producing the observed distributions of ${}^{15}N_2$, given that 407 an organic ¹⁴N pool up to 1000 times greater than the ¹⁵NO_{2,3}⁻ concentration would be required. 408 409 Thus in this study, 'nitrite shunting' (de Brabandere et al. 2013) is a reasonable mechanism to explain a significant portion of the Δ_{resid} . At 2 days in the ETSP incubations, ²⁹N₂ and ³⁰N₂ were 410 411 binomially distributed, which is consistent with 'nitrite shunting' not affecting the predicted distribution of ${}^{29}N_2$ and ${}^{30}N_2$ since ${}^{15}NO_3$ was used as the tracer. At 5.7 d, Δ_{resid} becomes 412 significant which may be due to changes in the fraction ¹⁵N-labeled of the substrates, suggested 413 414 by significant changes in the concentrations of NO_3^- and NO_2^- . Additionally, similar to denitrification rates, Δ_{resid} was significantly affected by only the addition of POM (p < 0.005); no 415 significant effect was observed between stations, depths, or with the addition of NH₄⁺. This 416 417 response suggests a heterotrophic source for Δ_{resid} .

419 **References**

- 420 Barber, R. T. 1968. Dissolved organic carbon from deep waters resists microbial oxidation. Nature 220:
- 421 274-275, doi:10.1038/220274a0
- 422 Berelson, W. M. 2001. The flux of particulate organic carbon into the ocean interior: A comparison of
- 423 four U. S. JGOFS regional studies. Oceanography 14: 59-67.
- Betlach, M. R., and J. M. Tiedje. 1981. Kinetic explanation for accumulation of nitrite, nitric-oxide, and
 nitrous-oxide during bacterial denitrification. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 42: 10741084.
- 427 Canfield, D. E., F. J. Stewart, B. Thamdrup, L. De Brabandere, T. Dalsgaard, E. F. Delong, N. P.
- 428 Revsbech, and O. Ulloa. 2010. A cryptic sulfur cycle in oxygen-minimum-zone waters off the
 429 Chilean coast. Science 330: 1375-1378, doi:10.1126/science.1196889
- 430 Codispoti, L. A., J. A. Brandes, J. P. Christensen, A. H. Devol, S. W. A. Naqvi, H. W. Paerl, and T.
- 431 Yoshinari. 2001. The oceanic fixed nitrogen and nitrous oxide budgets: Moving targets as we enter
 432 the anthropocene? Scientia Marina 65: 85-105.
- 433 Codispoti, L. A., and J. P. Christensen. 1985. Nitrification, denitrification and nitrous-oxide cycling in
- 434 the eastern tropical South Pacific Ocean. Marine Chemistry 16: 277-300, doi:10.1016/0304435 4203(85)90051-9
- 436 Dalsgaard, T., B. Thamdrup, L. Farias, and N. P. Revsbech. 2012. Anammox and denitrification in the
- 437 oxygen minimum zone of the eastern South Pacific. Limnology and Oceanography 57: 1331-1346,
 438 doi:10.4319/lo.2012.57.5.1331
- 439 De Boyer Montégut, C., G. Madec, A. S. Fischer, A. Lazar, and D. Iudicone. 2004. Mixed layer depth
- 440 over the global ocean: An examination of profile data and a profile-based climatology. Journal of
- 441 Geophysical Research-Oceans **109**: C12003, doi:10.1029/2004JC002378

442	De Brabandere, L., D. E. Canfield, T. Dalsgaard, G. E. Friederich, N. P. Revsbech, O. Ulloa, and B.
443	Thamdrup. 2013. Vertical partitioning of nitrogen-loss processes across the oxic-anoxic interface
444	of an oceanic oxygen minimum zone. Environmental Microbiology, doi:10.1111/1462-2920.12255
445	Druffel, E. R. M., P. M. Williams, J. E. Bauer, and J. R. Ertel. 1992. Cycling of dissolved and particulate
446	organic matter in the open ocean. Journal of Geophysical Research-Oceans 97: 15639-15659,
447	doi:10.1029/92jc01511
448	Emerson, S., C. Stump, D. Wilbur, and P. Quay. 1999. Accurate measurement of O ₂ , N ₂ , and Ar gases in
449	water and the solubility of N_2 . Marine Chemistry 64 : 337-347, doi:10.1016/S0304-4203(98)00090-
450	5
451	Farrenkopf, A. M., and G. W. Luther. 2002. Iodine chemistry reflects productivity and denitrification in
452	the Arabian Sea: evidence for flux of dissolved species from sediments of western India into the
453	OMZ. Deep-Sea Research II 49: 2303-2318, doi:10.1016/S0967-0645(02)00038-3
454	Hamersley, M. R., G. Lavik, D. Woebken, J. E. Rattray, P. Lam, E. C. Hopmans, J. S. S. Damste, S.
455	Kruger, M. Graco, D. Gutierrez, and M. M. M. Kuypers. 2007. Anaerobic ammonium oxidation in
456	the Peruvian oxygen minimum zone. Limnology and Oceanography 52: 923-933.
457	Hansell, D. A., and C. A. Carlson. 1998. Deep-ocean gradients in the concentration of dissolved organic
458	carbon. Nature 395 : 263-266, doi:10.1038/26200
459	Jensen, M. M., P. Lam, N. P. Revsbech, B. Nagel, B. Gaye, M. S. M. Jetten, and M. M. M. Kuypers.
460	2011. Intensive nitrogen loss over the Omani Shelf due to anammox coupled with dissimilatory
461	nitrite reduction to ammonium. The International Society for Microbial Ecology Journal 5: 1660-
462	1670, doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.44
463	Kalvelage, T., G. Lavik, P. Lam, S. Contreras, L. Arteaga, C. R. Loscher, A. Oschlies, A. Paulmier, L.
464	Stramma, and M. M. M. Kuypers. 2013. Nitrogen cycling driven by organic matter export in the

- 465 South Pacific oxygen minimum zone. Nature Geoscience **6**: 228-234, doi:10.1038/ngeo1739
- Karl, D. M., G. A. Knauer, J. H. Martin, and B. B. Ward. 1984. Bacterial chemolithotrophy in the ocean
 is associated with sinking particles. Nature **309**: 54-56, doi:10.1038/309054a0
- 468 Kuypers, M. M. M., G. Lavik, D. Woebken, M. Schmid, B. M. Fuchs, R. Amann, B. B. Jorgensen, and
- 469 M. S. M. Jetten. 2005. Massive nitrogen loss from the Benguela upwelling system through
- 470 anaerobic ammonium oxidation. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United
- 471 States of America **102**: 6478-6483, doi:10.1073/pnas.0502088102
- 472 Lam, P., G. Lavik, M. M. Jensen, J. van de Vossenberg, M. Schmid, D. Woebken, D. Gutierrez, R.
- 473 Amann, M. S. M. Jetten, and M. M. M. Kuypers. 2009. Revising the nitrogen cycle in the Peruvian
- 474 oxygen minimum zone. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences **106**: 4752-4757,
- 475 doi:10.1073/pnas.0812444106
- 476 Lee, C., D. W. Murray, R. T. Barber, K. O. Buesseler, J. Dymond, J. I. Hedges, S. Honjo, S. J.
- 477 Manganini, J. Marra, C. Moser, M. L. Peterson, W. L. Prell, S. G. Wakeham, and G. Arabian Sea
- 478 Carbon Flux. 1998. Particulate organic carbon fluxes: compilation of results from the 1995 US
- 479 JGOFS Arabian Sea Process Study. Deep-Sea Research II 45: 2489-2501, doi:10.1016/S0967-
- 480 0645(98)00079-4
- 481 Luther, G. W., B. Sundby, B. L. Lewis, P. J. Brendel, and N. Silverberg. 1997. Interactions of

482 manganese with the nitrogen cycle: Alternative pathways to dinitrogen. Geochimica Et

483 Cosmochimica Acta **61**: 4043-4052, doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(97)00239-1

- 484 Martin, J. H., G. A. Knauer, D. M. Karl, and W. W. Broenkow. 1987. Vertex carbon cycling in the
- 485 Northeast Pacific. Deep-Sea Research **34**: 267-285, doi:10.1016/0198-0149(87)90086-0
- 486 Moffett, J. W., T. J. Goeffert, and S. W. A. Naqvi. 2007. Reduced iron associated with secondary nitrite
- 487 maxima in the Arabian Sea. Deep-Sea Research I **54**: 1341-1349, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2007.04.004

- 488 Nicholls, J. C., C. A. Davies, and M. Trimmer. 2007. High-resolution profiles and nitrogen isotope
- tracing reveal a dominant source of nitrous oxide and multiple pathways of nitrogen gas formation
 in the central Arabian Sea. Limnology and Oceanography 52: 156-168.
- 491 Peterson, M. L., S. G. Wakeham, C. Lee, M. A. Askea, and J. C. Miquel. 2005. Novel techniques for
- 492 collection of sinking particles in the ocean and determining their settling rates. Limnology and
- 493 Oceanography: Methods **3**: 520-532.
- 494 Smith, D. C., M. Simon, A. L. Alldredge, and F. Azam. 1992. Intense hydrolytic enzyme activity on
- 495 marine aggregates and implications for rapid particle dissolution. Nature **359**: 139-142,
- 496 doi:10.1038/359139a0
- 497 Strickland, J. D. H., and T. R. Parsons. 1972. A practical handbook of seawater analysis. 2nd edition.
 498 Fisheries Research Board of Canada.
- 499 Thamdrup, B., T. Dalsgaard, M. M. Jensen, O. Ulloa, L. Farias, and R. Escribano. 2006. Anaerobic
- ammonium oxidation in the oxygen-deficient waters off northern Chile. Limnology and
- 501 Oceanography **51**: 2145-2156.
- 502 Thamdrup, B., T. Dalsgaard, and N. P. Revsbech. 2012. Widespread functional anoxia in the oxygen
- 503 minimum zone of the Eastern South Pacific. Deep-Sea Research I 65: 36-45,
- 504 doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2012.03.001
- Trimmer, M., and K. J. Purdy. 2012. Evidence for the direct oxidation of organic nitrogen to N₂ gas in
 the Arabian Sea. Isme Journal 6: 1798-1800, doi:10.1038/ismej.2012.18
- 507 Van de Graaf, A. A., A. Mulder, P. Debruijn, M. S. M. Jetten, L. A. Robertson, and J. G. Kuenen. 1995.
- Anaerobic oxidation of ammonium is a biologically mediated process. Applied and Environmental
 Microbiology 61: 1246-1251.
- 510 Walker, B. D., and M. D. McCarthy. 2012. Elemental and isotopic characterization of dissolved and

- 511 particulate organic matter in a unique California upwelling system: Importance of size and
- 512 composition in the export of labile material. Limnology and Oceanography **57**: 1757-1774,
- 513 doi:10.4319/lo.2012.57.6.1757
- 514 Ward, B. B., A. H. Devol, J. J. Rich, B. X. Chang, S. E. Bulow, H. Naik, A. Pratihary, and A.
- 515 Jayakumar. 2009. Denitrification as the dominant nitrogen loss process in the Arabian Sea. Nature
- **461**: 78-81, doi:10.1038/nature08276
- 517 Ward, B. B., C. B. Tuit, A. Jayakumar, J. J. Rich, J. Moffett, and S. W. A. Naqvi. 2008. Organic carbon,
- and not copper, controls denitrification in oxygen minimum zones of the ocean. Deep-Sea
- 519 Research I **55**: 1672-1683, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2008.07.005

Table 1

Station locations, sampling depths, and associated hydrographic characteristics. $[O_2]$ measured by Seabird O_2 sensor, detection limit ~1 μ mol L⁻¹. Detection limits of NO₃⁻, NO₂⁻, and NH₄⁺ were 0.08, 0.01, and 0.07 μ mol L⁻¹, respectively.

Station	Latitude	Longitude	Bottom depth (m)	Sampling depth (m)	Feature	$[O_2] (\mu \text{mol } L^{-1})$	$[NO_3]$ (μ mol L ⁻¹)	$[NO_{2}] $ (μ mol L ⁻¹)	$[\mathrm{NH}_{4}^{+}]$ (µmol L ⁻¹)
ETSP									
20	13.3°S	77°W	788	260	SNM	nd	24.3	4.4	0.1
AS									
1	19.4°N	66.7°E	3095	100	base of oxycline	nd	22.3	1.9	nd
				150	SNM	nd	15.1	5.7	0.06
2	15°N	64°E	3900	150	base of oxycline	nd	10.7	3.7	nd
				200	SNM	nd	7.6	7.7	nd

nd - not detected

521

Station	Feature	¹⁵ N-tracer ^a	Treatment
ETSP			
20	SNM	$^{15}NO_{3}(2)$	-
		$^{15}NO_{3}^{-}(2)$	glucose
		$^{15}\mathrm{NH}_{4}^{+}(1)$	_
		$^{15}\mathrm{NH}_{4}^{+}(1)$	glucose
AS			
1	SNM, base of oxycline	$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	_
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	¹⁴ NH ₄ ⁺
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	POM ^b
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	$POM + {}^{14}NH_4^+(5)$
		¹⁵ NO ₂ (5)	DOM ^c
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	$POM + {}^{14}NH_4^+(5)$
		$^{15}\mathrm{NH}_{4}^{+}(5)$	¹⁴ NO ₂
2	SNM, base of oxycline	¹⁵ NO, (5)	_
		$^{15}NO_{2}$ (5)	¹⁴ NH ₄ ⁺
		$^{15}NO_{2}$ (5)	POM
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	$POM + {}^{14}NH_4^+(5)$
		¹⁵ NO ₂ (5)	DOM
		$^{15}NO_{2}^{-}(5)$	$POM + {}^{14}NH_4^+(5)$
		$^{15}NH_{4}^{+}(5)$	¹⁴ NO ₂

Table 2Summary of ¹⁵N-labeled tracer additions and treatments.

^aTarget concentration of ¹⁵N tracer and ¹⁴NH₄⁺ in parentheses (μ mol L⁻¹); ^bPOM –

particulate organic carbon; $^{\circ}$ DOM – dissolved organic carbon. Both organic matter treatments came from sediment traps deployed approximately 20 and 50 m above the ODZ proper at Sta. 1 and 2, respectively. *See* text for details of preparation.

523 Figure legends

524

- 525 Figure 1: (A) [NO₃⁻] and (B) [NO₂⁻] in incubations with and without glucose added at Sta. 20 in
- 526 the ETSP ODZ. Vertical dashed line indicates when sample for ${}^{15}N_2$ was taken. Error bars
- 527 represent range of duplicates.

528

529 Figure 2: Denitrification, anammox, and Δ_{resid} rates in incubations with and without glucose 530 added at Sta. 20 in the ETSP ODZ.

531

532 Figure 3: Denitrification rates in control, DOM, and POM amended incubations at (A) Sta. 1 and

533 (B) Sta. 2 in the AS ODZ. Also shown are anammox rates measured in parallel incubations with

¹⁵NH₄⁺. Error bars are 1 standard deviation (SD). Anammox and denitrification (control only)

rates previously published in Ward et al. (2009).

536

- 537 Figure 4: Δ_{resid} in control, DOM, and POM amended incubations at (A) Sta. 1 and (B) Sta. 2 in
- 538 the AS ODZ. Δ_{resid} is the ²⁹N₂ production rate in excess of the amount predicted from the ³⁰N₂

production rate in ${}^{15}NO_2^{-} + {}^{14}NH_4^{+}$ incubations, assuming the N₂ isotopomers generated by

- 540 denitrification are binomially distributed. $^{29}N_2$ production from anammox was taken into
- 541 account in the calculation of Δ_{resid} . Error bars are 1 SD.



Figure 1



Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4